



# Metropolitan Transportation Commission

Bay Area Metro Center  
375 Beale Street  
San Francisco, CA 94105

## Meeting Minutes - Final

### Planning Committee

#### *MTC Committee Members:*

*James P. Spering, Chair Anne W. Halsted, Vice Chair*

*Alicia C. Aguirre, Scott Haggerty,*

*Steve Kinsey, Sam Liccardo, Julie Pierce*

*Non-Voting Members: Tom Azumbrado, Dorene M. Giacopini*

---

Friday, May 13, 2016

9:40 AM

The Board Room - 1st Floor

---

## 1. Roll Call / Confirm Quorum

### Rollcall

**Present:** 6 - Commissioner Aguirre, Commissioner Haggerty, Vice Chair Halsted, Commissioner Liccardo, Commissioner Pierce, and Chairperson Spering

**Absent:** 1 - Commissioner Kinsey

Non-Voting Member Present: Commissioner Azumbrado

Non-Voting Member Absent: Commissioner Giacopini

Ex Officio Voting Members Present: Commission Chair Cortese and  
Commission Vice Chair Mackenzie

Ad Hoc Non-Voting Members Present: Commissioner Bates, Commissioner Campos, and  
Commissioner Wiener

## 2. Consent Calendar

Approval of the Consent Calendar

**Upon the motion by Commissioner Aguirre and second by Commissioner Liccardo, the Consent Calendar was approved as amended by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 6 - Commissioner Aguirre, Commissioner Haggerty, Vice Chair Halsted, Commissioner Liccardo, Commissioner Pierce and Chairperson Spering

**Absent:** 1 - Commissioner Kinsey

2a. [15-1456](#) Minutes of the April 8, 2016 Meeting

**Action:** Committee Approval

### 3. Approval

- 3a. [15-1458](#) Plan Bay Area 2040 Project Performance Assessment: Final Performance Results and Guidelines for Applying Results

Final results from the project performance assessment and state of good repair performance assessment, seeking action on thresholds for high- and low-performance.

**Action:** Commission Approval

**Presenter:** Kristen Carnarius and Dave Vautin

The following individuals spoke on this item:

Robert Macaulay of STA;

Roland Lebrun;

Mike Baratta; and

Amber Crabbe of SFCTA.

**Upon the motion by Commissioner Aguirre and second by Commissioner Pierce, Plan Bay Area 2040 Project Performance Assessment: Final Performance Results and Guidelines for Applying Results was adopted to be forwarded to the Commission for approval. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 4 - Commissioner Aguirre, Commissioner Haggerty, Commissioner Pierce and Chairperson Sperring

**Absent:** 3 - Vice Chair Halsted, Commissioner Kinsey and Commissioner Liccardo

Commissioner Halsted and Commissioner Liccardo departed before the vote on Plan Bay Area 2040 Project Performance Assessment: Final Performance Results and Guidelines for Applying Results.

#### 4. Information

4a. [15-1504](#) Plan Bay Area 2040:Scenario Evaluation

Presentation on the Plan Bay Area 2040 scenarios and their initial targets evaluation.

**Action:** Information

**Presenter:** Ken Kirkey

David Zisser of Public Advocates was called to speak.

Matt Vander Sluis of Greenbelt Alliance was called to speak.

Jerry Grace was called to speak.

4b. [15-1560](#) Update: Plan Bay Area 2040 Open Houses

Update on plans for nine open houses across the region on Plan Bay Area 2040 slated for late May and early June.

**Action:** Information

**Presenter:** Ellen Griffin

David Zisser of Public Advocates was called to speak.

#### 5. Public Comment / Other Business

#### 6. Adjournment / Next Meeting

**The next meeting of the Planning Committee will be June 10, 2016, 9:30 a.m. at the Board Room on the first floor of the Bay Area Metro Center, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA.**